



# PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION MINUTES

**PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING/PUBLIC HEARING  
FRIDAY, March 11<sup>th</sup>, 2022  
8:00 AM**

**Virtual Zoom Meeting + Council Chambers  
201 S. CORTEZ STREET  
PRESCOTT, ARIZONA  
(928) 777-1207**

## **I. CALL TO ORDER**

## **II. ATTENDANCE**

### **Members**

Robert Burford, Chairman  
Mike King  
James McCarver  
Michael Mirco, Vice-Chairman  
Rob Johnson  
Richard Sprain  
Mary Ann Suttles

### **Staff:**

Cat Moody, Historic Preservation Specialist  
Bryn Stotler, Community Development Director  
George Worley, Planning Manager  
Tammy Dewitt, Community Planner  
Kaylee Nunez, Recording Secretary

### **City Leadership:**

Eric Moore, Council Liaison, Absent  
Steve Sischka, Councilman  
Philip Goode, Mayor

## **III. REGULAR AGENDA**

*The meeting was called to order at 08:02 am by Chairman Burford*

- 1. Approval of the minutes from the February 11<sup>th</sup>, 2022 meeting.**

**Commissioner Suttles made a motion to approve the minutes of the February 11<sup>th</sup>, 2022 Preservation Commission meeting. Commissioner Sprain seconded the motion. The motion passed (7-0).**

**2. HP22-001 1099 Old Hassayampa Ln. APN: 108-07-166. Historic Preservation District #15, Historic Homes at Hassayampa. Request approval for change in single car garage door and 3ft and 6ft high fencing.**

Historic Preservation Specialist Cat Moody presented a brief history of the Hassayampa Country Club, where the property is located. The residence was one of the 14 summer cottages built in the 1930s and 1940s to support the Country Club. The applicant is requesting to replace the original, single-car garage door with a new, stamped carriage house door with paneled windows, which is within historic character.

Ms. Moody also presented a site plan and photos depicting the different fencing types being requested, which include:

- 3' high black steel fencing
- 6' high metal fencing
- 6' high wooden privacy fencing

Chairman Burford asked whether the existing, split rail fencing along Deodora Lane would be removed. Ms. Moody answered that it would be removed and replaced with the 6' metal fencing as depicted on the site plan.

Commissioner McCarver asked whether there are any City restrictions on the height of the Fencing. Ms. Moody clarified that fencing can only be 4' high within the front setback and can be 6' high on the side and rear.

**Commissioner Suttles made a motion to approve HP22-001. Commissioner Mirco seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously (7-0).**

**3. Study-session review of proposed project (non-voting item at this meeting)**

**HP22-003** 138 S Montezuma St. APN: 109-02-014A. Historic Preservation District #1, Courthouse Plaza. Request review and input on proposal for demolition of existing building and construction of six-story hotel.

Historic Preservation Specialist Cat Moody presented a history of the site, which originally contained wooden structures. After the Historic Whiskey Row Fire of 1900, it was rebuilt with a brick building and has housed saloons, restaurants and a variety of retail uses since. The roof and façade were reconstructed after a large snowstorm collapsed it in 1967. The building currently houses two retail shops and one art gallery.

Ms. Moody then presented elevations, exterior finishes, and artistic renderings of the proposed hotel. She noted that highest point of the building is 66'-10" (from existing grade). Ms. Moody also shared that this project has *only* been to a Pre-Application Conference (PAC) with the City prior to this meeting, which is only a preliminary meeting with staff to see if a project is viable and what requirements will be involved.

Applicant and property owner, Jim Griset, spoke about his vision for the property. He noted that he is a resident of Prescott Valley and has owned the subject property for approximately 7 years. He and his designer, Ray Spencer, created the 'stepped' design to avoid too dramatic of a rise in the front of the building and put design emphasis on the alley entrance to further

foster new life in that area. He believes that the project would contribute to the City's effort to revitalize the Whiskey Row Alley.

Ms. Moody presented a perspective analysis, which revealed that the artistic renderings depicted the proposed building as smaller than what it will actually be. She presented sketches of the Whiskey Row facades created by local Architect, Bill Otwell, in the 1980s. She then overlaid the proposed hotel upon the façade to give an idea of the difference of heights between it and other buildings on Whiskey Row. Ms. Moody shared that there are a couple of ways in which potential (historic) projects are evaluated, one of them being that they compare them to the National standards set forth by the Secretary of the Interior; this site being within the most important, National district in Prescott. She revealed that the current building(s) is not on the National Register but potentially could be if they applied and took certain measures.

Ms. Moody then presented her official staff report on the proposed project which determined that it does not conform with the (local) Courthouse Plaza Historic District guidelines, nor does it comply with (national) guidelines as set forth by the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Historic Resources. The scale, massing, height, and architectural styles proposed are incompatible and the existing building should be maintained, and any addition should not exceed 3 stories if the applicant decides to pursue further development of this property.

Patricia Dahlen, Architect for the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) spoke in opposition to the proposed project based upon the Secretary of Interior's Standards and interest of maintaining the historic character of the Courthouse Plaza.

Local Architect, Bill Otwell, spoke in opposition to the proposed project. Mr. Otwell has worked with several, historic properties in Prescott over the past four decades. He emphasized the cultural significance of the Courthouse Plaza for the community and shared that he believes that allowing this project could open up the District to further degradation.

Another local Architect, Frank DeGrazia, who has also been involved with historic properties in Prescott spoke in opposition to the proposal. He mirrored many of Mr. Otwell's opinions and feels that this project should not go forward as it is not in conformance with the (historic) district guidelines.

Ms. Moody presented a summary of public input received on the proposal thus far, 93% of which is opposed and 7% in favor. The top five concerns being: Location, height, architectural style, parking, and precedent.

Thirty-two members of the public shared comments, all in opposition. Key concerns were as follows, in order of prevalence:

- Failure to adhere to local and/or national historic guidelines
- Negative impacts on the character and culture of the Courthouse Plaza
- Too large/scale and massing issues
- Negative impacts on nearby business owners
- Parking issues
- Negative impacts on citizens' quality of life
- Negative impacts on alley during construction
- Public safety concerns
- Importance of historic preservation for future generations

Commissioner Mirco asked whether the building was seven stories, not six. Applicant Jim Griset answered that it is seven with the basement included and that they would be creating a basement as one does not currently exist.

Commissioner Sprain expressed that the building is beautiful but belongs elsewhere, he also questioned whether the applicant consulted the district guidelines before designing. Mr. Griset answered that he did and that the 'stair-stepping' of the design was their solution to mitigating impacts on surrounding buildings.

Commissioner Suttles summarized that all the comments she heard were in opposition and that she is open to voting on the project next month (April).

Commissioner McCarver stated that his job on the Preservation Commission is to stick with the rules and regulations that have been created to preserve the (historic nature) of the community.

Commissioner Johnson commended Mr. Otwell on his input as well as that of the public and that he feels that the Courthouse (district) guidelines are especially important to be adhered to.

Chairman Burford concluded by stating that there are solutions out there for this project; but the one presented today will not succeed.

**VI. UPDATE OF CURRENT EVENTS OR OTHER ITEMS OF NOTE**

None

**VII. ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting Adjourned at 10:31 am



Kaylee Nunez, Recorder



Robert Burford, Chairman