



MINUTES
PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Friday, September 14, 2007 - 8:00 AM
City Council Chambers
201 S. Cortez Street, Prescott, AZ

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ATTENDANCE

MEMBERS PRESENT

Doug Stroh, Chairman
Frank DeGrazia, Vice-Chairman
Russ Buchanan
Don Rantz
Mike Todd
Marv Wright

OTHERS PRESENT

George Worley, Assistant Community
Development Director
Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation Specialist
Kathy Dudek, Commission Recording Secretary

MEMBERS ABSENT

None

III. REGULAR AGENDA

1. **HP07-014, 202 S. Montezuma Street**, former gas station site/vacant land; Courthouse Plaza Historic Preservation District #1. APN: 109-02-046A. Zoning is Downtown Business District (DTB). Review of request for approval of minor changes to the north and west elevations only. Applicant is Ryan Smith, Barclay Smith Architects. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess. (*Continued from 06-08-07, 8-10-07*).

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- this is the fourth review of the proposed project;
- the project is located in the Courthouse Plaza Historic Preservation District #1;
- both the developer and architect are here today; and,
- the architect has a PowerPoint™ presentation.

Mr. Ryan Smith, Barclay Smith Architects, 2409 N. 4th Street, Flagstaff, stated:

- there have been additional, minor modifications to the rear of the building;
- changes have been made to enhance the interior;
- the north and west units are the only units that have been changed;
- the front of the building [as originally approved] on Montezuma Street has not changed;
- the changes have given the interior spaces more openness and light;
- the top floor remains without change;

- balconies have been widened; and,
- windows at the stairwell have been reduced.

Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- the concrete cap that appears on the Goodwin Street side and the lack of the cap appearing on the front [Montezuma Street] [Mr. Smith: we did miss that];
- the back elevation of the lower right end corner no longer has a window [Mr. Smith: the electric service and gas meters will go on that wall];
- horizontal lines on Goodwin Street elevation that look very busy [Mr. Smith: 1) the lines define the first floor units; 2) the exterior gives a scale of how the building is organized, and, 3) the lines lower the visual look;
- the elimination of the glazing over the arched windows is a major change resulting in the building losing “character”;
- including a condition of approval that the arched windows are included;
- the preference of retaining the plans that were first approved which makes the north side appearance more pleasing for The Plaza area; and,
- restoring the arched windows to the plans [Mr. Smith: no problem bringing the arched windows back].

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to approve HP07-014**, 202 S. Montezuma Street, subject to the agency comments listed on the memo dated August 28, 2007 and with the exception that the windows be returned to arched windows that were originally approved. Mr. Todd, 2nd. **Vote: 4-2** (dissenting votes: DeGrazia, Wright).

2. **HP07-033, 232 N. Granite Street (Prescott Center for Adult Education).** Historic Preservation District #4. APN: 113-14-057. Zoning is Industrial Light (IL). Request for approval of revisions to remodel interior and exterior, Sam'l Hill Warehouse, for use as a gallery/classroom. Owner is Prescott College. Applicant is Otwell Associates. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Mr. DeGrazia recused himself due to a potential conflict of interest.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the request is for a change to the previously approved Sam'l Hill Warehouse remodeling plans;
- the proposed change provides an alternate design for the entryway on the west elevation; and,
- Mr. Bill Otwell, architect, is here to outline the requested change.

Mr. Bill Otwell, 121 E. Goodwin, submitted:

- the request is the result of the contractor getting involved;
- the request is to have the ability to select either the previously approved plan or the proposed change;
- today's request is less expensive; and,
- Prescott College is still raising funds and would like the ability to use an alternative plan based on the money that is raised.

Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- the interior brick walls having plaster over them [Mr. Otwell: the detail wall

will be suspended from a ledge and is reversible].

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to approve HP07-033**, 232 N. Granite Street, subject to compliance with agency comments listed within the staff memo dated September 5, 2007. Mr. Wright, 2nd. **Vote: 5-0-1** (recused: DeGrazia).

3. **HP07-032, 128 S. Mt. Vernon Street.** Southeast Prescott Preservation District #13. APN: 110-01-012. Zoning is Single-Family 9 (SF-9). Request permit for a new garage and support for a variance for lot coverage and height exception. Owner is Richard Belveal. Applicant/agent is Bill Otwell, Otwell Associates, Architects. Community Planner, Mike Bacon.

Mr. DeGrazia recused himself due to a potential conflict of interest.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the existing, non-historic two car garage will be demolished and a new garage will be constructed;
- the new garage will have a driveway cut from Mt. Vernon;
- the proposal will require a variance, and the Commission is being asked for support;
- the variance is needed for 1) exceeding the height requirement of 20' by 5'9" to enable the roof planes to match the historic building, and 2) to exceed the maximum lot coverage of 40% to 45.9%;
- the request for increase in lot coverage is only 2.3% as the maximum lot coverage has already been exceeded and is grandfathered as non-conforming.
- photos of the elevations were presented;
- the paint will match the house; and,
- three dormers will exist on the north side.

Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- the allowable lot coverage has already been exceeded; and,
- was the existing exceeding lot coverage done with a variance [Mr. Otwell: No, it was not caught].

Ms. Burgess noted that there are two parts to this request: 1) the new garage; and, 2) support for a variance.

Mr. Otwell proffered:

- the new Code [*Land Development Code*] requires garage doors be set back 6' from the alley;
- the existing garage encroaches into the required setback;
- the new garage will not encroach into the required setback;
- the existing garage is out of character with the neighborhood because the roof pitch is flat;
- neighbors on both sides prefer to see the new design.

Chairman Stroh asked if anyone from the public wished to speak. No one came forward.

Mr. Todd, **MOTION: to approve HP07-032**, 128 S. Mt. Vernon Street. Mr. Wright, 2nd. **Vote: 5-0-1** (recused: DeGrazia).

Mr. Todd, **MOTION: to recommend support** of a request for a variance at 128 S. Mt. Vernon Street to the Board of Adjustment. Mr. Rantz, 2nd. Vote: 5-0-1 (recused: DeGrazia).

4. **Consider approval** of the minutes of the 08-10-07 meeting.

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve the minutes** of the August 10, 2007 meeting. Mr. Stroh, 2nd. **Vote: 6-0.**

IV. SUMMARY OF CURRENT OR RECENT EVENTS

None.

V. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Stroh adjourned the meeting at 8:42 AM.

Doug Stroh, Chairman