



**MINUTES**  
**PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION**  
**Friday, June 8, 2007 - 8:00 AM**  
**City Council Chambers**  
**201 S. Cortez Street, Prescott, AZ**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

**II. ATTENDANCE**

**MEMBERS**

Doug Stroh, Chairman  
Frank DeGrazia, Vice-Chairman  
Russ Buchanan  
Lorri Carlson  
Don Rantz  
Mike Todd  
Marv Wright

**STAFF PRESENT**

George Worley, Assistant Community  
Development Director  
Gary Kidd, City Attorney  
Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation Specialist  
Mike Bacon, Community Planner  
Kathy Dudek, Recording Secretary

**III. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

- A. HP07-019, 217 Union Street, The Goldwater House**, 1978 Prescott MRA National Register District. Union Street Historic Preservation Overlay District #6. APN: 109-01-036. Zoning is Multi-Family High (MF-H). Request for approval of a building permit to remodel house into two apartments, including the addition of an exterior elevator enclosure. Applicant is Goldwater House, LLC (Phil McClanahan). Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess. *(Continued from May 11, 2007).*

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- a new set of drawings was submitted today;
- Commissioners previously reviewed the project at the May 11, 2007 meeting;
- a major issue with the design of the elevator shaft on the east side of the house was previously discussed;
- Commissioners requested design changes and moving the elevator to a new location;
- the applicant was requested to show elevation photos;
- guidelines preclude the removal of the large stained glass window; and,
- Maureen Moresh, designer, is here to answer questions.

Mr. Phil McClanahan, 220 S. Mt. Vernon, gave an overview of the project which included:

- the property was originally approved for five apartments;
- he is requesting two condominium units instead of the five allotted apartments;

- the interiors will be finished and will maintain an integrity of existing elements;
- the small elevator addition is designed to allow handicap and elderly access; and,
- the elevator addition totals approximately 70 square feet with 26 square feet on the lower floor.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- emergency exit, stairs, etc., on the back of the building [Mr. McClanahan: the stairs are unsightly and there is an internal stairway from the second to the third floor. Stairs on the lower level would be built around a tree that will be preserved];
- problems with the scale and proportion on the elevator roof being too small and not blending in with the existing house;
- if the porch is to be extended, a column and roofline need to be added to keep with the massing of the house;
- pictures of the house must be sent in to the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) to ascertain if the house will maintain its historic integrity [Ms. Burgess: SHPO is concerned with the front of the house and what is seen from the street];
- tax reduction [Ms. Burgess: both of the condo owners will be able to apply for a portion of the tax reduction];
- the placement of the elevator, whether placed on the east or back side of the property, would only give access to the second floor; consequently, if the back parking space is designated for the second floor, it would be better to have the handicap access at the back;
- moving the elevator to the back would result in a free-standing shaft;
- the dimensions of the elevator [Mr. McClanahan: approximately 70 SF total with 26 SF on the first level. A vestibule is needed for the elevator. Entering at one door and exiting via another door in the elevator has been considered. The design we have now we think is best];
- an addition on the side, and visible from the front, is not encouraged under the guidelines; and,
- no significant elevator differentiation has occurred from the plans presented last month with those presented at today's meeting.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the Secretary of the Interior's guidelines and indicated that the Goldwater House is one of the most significant historic homes in Prescott. The design, as presented, is not what Ms. Burgess would prefer to see.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to deny HP07-019**, 217 Union Street as presented. Ms. Carlson, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 5-2** (dissenting votes: DeGrazia, Todd). **Request is denied.**

The applicant, Mr. McClanahan, was told that he could apply to have the request re-argendized.

- B. HP07-014, 202 South Montezuma Street**, former gas station site/vacant land; Courthouse Plaza Historic Preservation District #1. APN: 109-02-046A. Zoning is Downtown Business District (DTB). Review of request for approval of minor changes to the north and west elevations only. Applicant is Ryan Smith, Barclay Smith Architects. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- she and George Worley met with the architect, Ryan Smith, and Mr. Christianson regarding proposed changes to the north and west side of the building;
- only the north side of the building will be looked at today;
- the elevation changes were presented on the overhead; and,
- in order to accommodate the floor plan, changes to the balconies on the 4<sup>th</sup> floor have been made.

Mr. Brad Christianson, 3260 Blackjack Ridge Road, indicated:

- the request is being made to accommodate interior design changes;
- long, narrow internal hallways would be redesigned; and,
- the design changes to the interior have caused the request for changes to the exterior of the building.

Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- the west elevation has changed dramatically;
- concern with the back portion of the building being flat and monotonous;
- the changes to the balconies are negative changes;
- the three bottom floors become similar and look like a dormitory building;
- the resultant loss of classic architecture and the loss of detail; and,
- the loss of the arched windows is detrimental to the overall project.

Mr. Worley proffered that the west elevation could be requested to be placed on next month's meeting agenda.

Commissioners further queried and discussed:

- the floor-by-floor changes;
- moving the proposed balcony windows so that the windows are shaded;
- the disadvantage of going from a visually horizontal building to a visually vertical building;
- the previous proposal deemphasized the height of the building;
- the interior of the building is not Commission's concern;
- any building facing west without covered windows will be problematic, a solar nightmare;
- a preference for the proposed first elevation's west side; and,
- psychologically, the building will appear to be 10-feet higher.

Mr. Christianson agrees with many of the comments. He suggested that the project go back to the drawing board.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to continue HP07-014**, 202 South Montezuma Street to the July 13, 2007 meeting at 8:00 AM. Mr. Stroh, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 7-0.**

- C. HP07-020, 132 – 134 S. Montezuma Street.** Courthouse Plaza District. APN: 109-02-013. Zoning is Downtown Business (DTB). Request for approval of remodel and paint color palette. Applicant/owner is Robert W. Fields, Jr. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- both buildings are owned by the same person;
- neither building is listed in the National Register because of the loss of historic integrity;
- the owners' representative is here and has prepared a model to show the details of one aspect of the request;
- the request deals primarily with the rear of the building's loading docks replacement with new docks and stairs;
- the intent of the remodel is to make the area more user friendly; and,
- a future project, that would have to come before Commission, is a porch covering.

Mr. Bob Fields, 4421 Lone Cactus, Prescott Valley, presented an orientation of the docks and parking lots. A metal panel door will replace a metal slab door.

Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- a loading dock not being required by Code;
- moving the stairs [Mr. Fields: The stairs were built by me 44 years ago. Changing the stairs to the other side will be within Code and the loading dock can be made similar with more room for parking. Both stair areas will be left open at all times]; and,
- a model of the stairs was presented.

The following *two* motions were made to cover Agenda Items C & D:

- 1) Ms. Carlson, **MOTION: to approve HP07-020 & HP07-021, request for remodel** as submitted. Mr. DeGrazia, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 7-0.**
- 2) Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to approve HP07-020 & HP07-021, request for paint color** palette as provided by applicant. Mr. Wright, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 7-0.**

- D. HP07-021, 128 – 130 S. Montezuma Street.** Courthouse Plaza District. APN: 109-02-013A. Zoning is Downtown Business (DTB). Request for approval of remodel and paint color palette. Applicant/owner is Robert W. Fields, Jr. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

*Refer to motions in Item C above.*

- E. In Lieu of Parking, Land Development Code, Section 4.9.** Presentation and discussion of proposed amendment to the *Land Development Code*. George Worley, Assistant Community Development Director.

*No action taken.*

- F. Update regarding Statewide Historic Preservation Conference,** June 13-16, 2007 in Prescott. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

*No action taken.*

**G. Consider approval** of the minutes of 5-11-07 meeting.

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve the minutes** of the May 11, 2007 meeting. Mr. Todd, 2<sup>nd</sup>. Vote: 5-0-2 (abstention due to absence: Carlson, Stroh).

**IV. SUMMARY OF CURRENT OR RECENT EVENTS**

None.

**V. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 10:10 AM.

---

Doug Stroh, Chairman