



MINUTES
PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Friday, May 11, 2007 - 8:00 AM
City Council Chambers
201 S. Cortez Street, Prescott, AZ

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ATTENDANCE

MEMBERS

Frank DeGrazia, Vice-Chairman
Russ Buchanan
Don Rantz
Mike Todd
Marv Wright

MEMBERS ABSENT

Doug Stroh, Chairman
Lorri Carlson

STAFF PRESENT

George Worley, Assistant Community
Development Director
Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation
Specialist
Mike Bacon, Community Planner
Kathy Dudek, Recording Secretary

III. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

- A. HP07-018, 105 South Alarcon Street, Gage-Murphy House, 1978 Prescott MRA National Register District. Southeast Prescott Historic Preservation Overlay District #13. APN: #109-01-052. Zoning is Business General (BG). Request for approval of a building permit to remodel house and garage. Applicant is Donovan Myers. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess. (Continued from the April 13, 2007 meeting).**

Ms. Burgess noted that this is the second review for the project and changes include:

- removing the garage door and installing a French door;
- horizontal wood siding and trim is the preferred choice; and,
- stucco would be the second choice.

Mr. Don Biele, 430 Acoma, was present to answer questions.

Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- the door style to be used;
- what the structure is presently used for [Mr. Biele: storage, no plumbing exists in the structure]; and,
- proposed color [Mr. Biele: matched to the house].

Mr. Biele added that he would like to use a wood railing at the top of the garage and that the canvas awning to the right of the door would be his preference. The other

choice is to put a wood roof that goes all the way across with a corbel. Mr. Biele stated that Preservation Chairman Stroh designed the plans that he is presenting today.

Chairman DeGrazia stated for the record that Mr. Stroh, had he been present today, would have had to recuse himself from this item.

Ms. Burgess asked Mr. Biele if the shed roof with corbels would require posts as the posts trigger a setback encroachment.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to approve HP07-018** with the following conditions of approval: 1) comply with agency comments listed within this memo dated May 1, 2007; 2) the color of the garage is to match the house; and, 3) that wood be used instead of stucco on the garage. Mr. Wright, 2nd. **Vote: 5-0.** (*first of two motions*)

After discussion of a variance being needed for the rear setback, it was noted that a variance would not be needed if the roof did not extend across the entire length of the rear of the structure and that a 3' maximum encroachment would be permissible. A second, added motion was then made.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to approve HP07-018**, 105 S. Alarcon Street, as regarding the rear elevation: the awnings be provided and constructed of wood not to exceed 3' from the house and not to cover the entire length of the back of the house; and, with architectural shingles and paint color to match the rest of the house with a corbel detail to be approved by staff. Mr. Wright, 2nd. **Vote: 5-0.** (*second of two motions*)

- B. HP07-019, 217 Union Street, The Goldwater House**, 1978 Prescott MRA National Register District. Union Street Historic Preservation Overlay District #6. APN: #109-01-036. Zoning is Multi-family High (MF-H). Request for approval of a building permit to remodel house into two apartments, including the addition of an exterior elevator enclosure. Applicant is Goldwater House, LLC (Phil McClanahan). Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and noted:

- the owners have made a major shift in plans and design;
- in addition to the carriage house, the house will now have only two separate units;
- the previous permit has been voided;
- the Goldwater House previously housed seven apartments;
- a structural change is requested on the east side of the house for an elevator;
- an additional stairway to the rear of the house on the east side will give access to the second floor and will be partially hidden by the elevator;
- the addition on the east side will be demolished as it is not a quality addition;
- and,
- no other changes to the appearance of the house have been proposed.

Mr. Phil McClanahan, co-owner, 220 S. Mt. Vernon, was present to answer questions.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- a window located in the foyer (north façade) into the elevator shaft is needed;
- total square footage [Mr. McClanahan: 4,200];
- placing the elevator at the rear of the house [Mr. McClanahan: there is a deck at the rear of the house, and stairs to the catwalk will be removed]; and,
- iron or wood stairs being preferable to an elevator.

Ms. Maureen Morsch, designer, 3179 W. Crestview, indicated she advised her clients to install a window in the elevator façade. She indicated that the roof will be duplicated on the addition because it ties in with the arch banding.

Commissioners further queried:

- landscaping plans for the elevator addition [Mr. McClanahan: large trees are located in the front and landscaping plans will camouflage the elevator];
- little add-on structures like this destroy the buildings integrity; and,
- the elevator should be moved to the rear of the structure.

Mr. McClanahan further stated that the complete roof of the elevator shaft could be at the height of the second story and he would like to extend the railing around the corner and tie in the elevator shaft.

Mr. Adam Rowling, 325 E. Gurley Street, indicated that the needs of the owners should be put before the needs of a historical plan. Sometimes needs of handicapped persons are not considered.

The first motion to approve did *not* carry. (Vote: 3-2 with DeGrazia and Rantz casting nay votes).

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to continue HP07-019** until the June 8, 2007 meeting at 8:00 am. Mr. Wright, 2nd. **Vote: 5-0.**

C. Update regarding Statewide Historic Preservation Conference, June 13-16, 2007 in Prescott. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Ms. Burgess noted that over 1,500 brochures were sent to prospective conference attendees. There is a pass-through grant that will fund the Commissioners' registration fees.

D. Discussion regarding 5 new historic markers for FY 2007/2008.

Ms. Burgess indicated that three new historic markers have been installed with locations at the Brinkmeyer Hotel, the Head Hotel, and at the Hassayampa Inn.

Discussion ensued with Commissioners discussing places to install the five new markers that have been City funded.

In a separate historic preservation grant, funds are allocated for a new brochure, updated archeological maps, and the conference scholarships (2008).

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to place** the 5 new historic markers as follows: 1 at the Pine Crest Historic District; 1 at the Mountain States Telephone Building; 1 at the West Prescott Historic District; and 2 at the East Prescott Historic District. Mr. Todd, 2nd. **Vote: 5-0.**

E. Consider approval of the minutes of 4-13-07 meeting.

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve the minutes** of the April 13, 2007 meeting. Mr. Buchanan, 2nd. **Vote: 5-0.**

IV. SUMMARY OF CURRENT OR RECENT EVENTS

None.

V. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 10:10 AM.

Doug Stroh, Chairman