



MINUTES
PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Friday, April 13, 2007 - 8:00 AM
City Council Chambers
201 S. Cortez Street, Prescott, AZ

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ATTENDANCE

MEMBERS PRESENT

Doug Stroh, Chairman
Frank DeGrazia, Vice-Chairman
Russ Buchanan
Lori Carlson
Don Rantz
Mike Todd
Marv Wright

OTHERS PRESENT

George Worley, Assistant Community
Development Director
Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation
Specialist
Mike Bacon, Community Planner
Gwen Rowitsch, Private Development
Facilitator
Jane Bristol, Economic Development
Kathy Dudek, Recording Secretary

III. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

- A. Introduction of** new member, Mike Todd.
- B. HP07-016, 702 East Gurley Street, Grace Sparkes Memorial Activity Center (Prescott Armory),** Prescott Armory Historic Preservation District #11. APN: #114-04-044. Zoning is Recreation Space (RS). Request for approval of a permit for two signs (already installed). Applicant is the City of Prescott. Community Planner, Mike Bacon.

Mr. Bacon indicated that the sign conforms to the design guidelines of District #1. The application is for signage at Ken Lindley Field and Fann Skatepark.

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve HP07-016, 702 E. Gurley Street, in accordance with Exhibit "A" dated April 13, 2007. Ms. Carlson, 2nd. Vote: 7-0.**

- C. HP07-017, 102 North Montezuma Street, Wilson Block,** Courthouse Plaza Historic Preservation District #1. APN: #113-15-093. Zoning is Downtown Business District (DTB). Request for approval of a permit for a sign. Applicant is Perry Wiewick, A&B Sign. Community Planner, Mike Bacon.

Mr. Bacon reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the property was originally known as the Wilson Block;
- the property's name was changed to the Ballentine Building by the current owner;
- the Cornerstone Bookstore will be replaced by Keller Williams Realty;
- the requested corner sign will be art deco in style with red neon halo lighting;

- the size of the sign is questionable as it extends out approximately 51” where a 36” maximum is permitted;
- a new sign plan was presented and dated April 13, 2007 with the total height at 151” and the total width at 36”;
- the sign must be placed at least 8’ off the ground.

Mr. Doug Bunch, 1260 E. Skyview Drive, indicated that the top of the sign will be raised to the top of the roof.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- interior window signage [Mr. Bacon: not regulated by Code];
- coordinating the sign with the canopy;
- color of sign [Mr. Bunch: cream];
- the scale and proportion of sign is not shown in the elevation;
- the brightness of the red neon, which should be kept at a low level; and,
- the elimination of the canopies on the second floor.

Mr. Don Biehle, 1240 Iron Springs Road, indicated for the record that the building was remodeled in the early 1990s and the building was rededicated to Bill Ballentine. Mr. Biehle feels that the building’s name should remain as rededicated.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to approve HP07-017**, 102 North Montezuma Street, with the conditions: 1) that the sign not extend more than 36 inches outward from the building; and, 2) that the sign is in substantial conformance to Exhibit “A” dated April 13, 2007. Mr. Stroh, 2nd. **Vote: 7-0.**

D. HP07-018, 105 South Alarcon Street, Gage-Murphy House, 1978 Prescott MRA National Register District. Southeast Prescott Historic Preservation Overlay District #13. APN: #109-01-052. Zoning is Business General (BG). Request for approval of a building permit to remodel house and garage. Applicant is Donovan Myers. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- there are two projects to the request, the garage and the house;
- this property is known as the Gage-Murphy House and was converted to apartments in the 30s or 40s; and,
- the west side of the building has become the front of the house.

Mr. Don Biele, 1240 Iron Springs Road, was present to answer questions.

Details of the garage request include:

- the garage is mainly stucco;
- the garage has no real architectural style and is not in the National Register;
- the proposal calls for repair work and trying to match it to look more like the Gage-Murphy House;
- the garage is now being used for storage;
- an alternate suggestion is to tear down the garage;
- applicant proposes to replace the stucco with horizontal siding to match the siding on house; and,
- proposals include adding corner pilasters that would give the structure more

architectural detail, and/or adding windows and French doors and a parapet around the parapet roof.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- consider tearing down the shed or make it look like a carriage house [Mr. Biehle: would like not to tear it down];
- the insufficiency of the plans given to staff;
- the tongue-and-groove existing siding;
- demolition of the garage would improve the site of the house and showcase it;
- if restoring the garage is elected, make it look like the timeframe in which it was built, i.e., the 1930s; and,
- Sharlot Hall maps should be consulted for more details of the property.

Mr. Biele indicated he asked three times whether the house was in the National Register. In looking at the historic inventory, the property is listed as ineligible individually but it is a contributor.

Ms. Burgess stated:

- a stop work order was issued on the property after a complaint by a neighbor;
- no building permits were issued prior to the start of the remodel;
- no building permits have been issued to date;
- the garage should not be remodeled to look like it was built in the 1890s because it was built in the 1930s or 1940s; and,
- adding elements that were never there is not a good practice for historic preservation.

Mr. Rantz commented that he cannot support the project as it stands because more information is needed. He indicated he could vote for demolition.

Ms. Carlson concurred with Mr. Rantz.

Mr. Biele indicated he was willing to come back before Commission. He indicated he wanted Commissioners to tell him what to do.

Mr. Adam Rowling, 325 E. Gurley Street, indicated he is no fan of historic preservation. He feels that Commission should let the owner improve the property as he [the property owner] wishes.

Ms. Carlson stated the property got into the condition it did because of a lack of following the preservation process.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to continue HP07-018, remodel of garage** at 105 South Alarcon Street, to the May 11, 2007 meeting at 8:00 AM. Mr. DeGrazia, 2nd.

Vote: 7-0.

Ms. Burgess and Commissioners indicated:

- a requirement for coming before Commission is tied to the building permit process;
- permits are needed based on the extent of the proposed work;
- the stop work order was placed on the house, not the garage;
- more than one scenario for the garage should be given to Commission with

greater detail.

Ms. Burgess indicated the following about the house remodel:

- the primary front of the house has been obscured by the adjacent UPS Store;
- the west side of the house has become the “front”;
- the house has a new roof;
- a permit for the roof was granted in error;
- work has taken place on the dormers;
- the awning is being taken down;
- the style of the house can be dressed up by the addition of posts to make it more compatible with the style;
- the porch is shown as enclosed on the 1940s map and is now living space; and,
- the flat canopy provides more weather protection.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- the interior canopy being removed [Mr. Biele: yes];
- plans to finish overhang that has been installed [Mr. Biele: the underside will be tongue-and-groove with a crown molding around the face of the roof];
- all poles need to be painted;
- posts should be boxed on the base [Mr. Biele: it is our intention];
- the box be constructed in proportion to the corner of the house;
- try not to replicate the front of the house;
- the windows are a small improvement over what they replaced [Mr. Biele: we did not change the opening size];
- treatment around the windows [Ms. Burgess: do not replicate trim on the historic windows around the house];
- the windows need a vertical strip to separate the two different sides of the flat panel [Mr. Biele suggested a round awning over the door];
- vertical, double-hung windows would be preferable;
- instead of a round canopy, another shed roof extending over the large window would be preferable;
- another alternative would be a canvas awning with sides to start at the head height at the smaller windows from the door and the 3x6 window about 3’ in depth; and,
- boxing in the pipe column.

Mr. Stroh, **MOTION: to approve HP07-018, remodel of house** at 105 South Alarcon Street subject to approving the existing siding on the house and the windows with the conditions that: 1) a canvas awning be added on the south side from the doors to the eastern window at a matching height with the bottom of the canopy at the same height; and, 2) leave the pipe columns as they are with an architectural piece added on the west side. Mr. Rantz, 2nd. **Vote: 7-0.**

Mr. Biele indicated he would bring something back on the garage house next month.

(A 5-minute recess was taken from 9:20 to 9:25 AM)

E. HP07-014, 202 South Montezuma Street, former gas station site/vacant land; Courthouse Plaza Historic Preservation District #1. APN: #109-02-046A. Zoning

is Downtown Business District (DTB). Second review of request for approval of a permit for new construction of infill, four-story mixed-use building. Applicant is Ryan Smith, Barclay Smith Architects. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- this is the second review and the applicant has made several changes;
- the applicant has a brief presentation of the changes that have been made per Commission's request;
- the guidelines cover 3-story buildings, not 4-story buildings;
- the maximum building height of 48' is permitted in the Downtown Business District (DTB) with the HPD;
- the proposed project calls out a 54' building height and may require a Special Use Permit from City Council;
- the building should be consistent with others around the Courthouse Plaza so that the Courthouse remains the highest building and a focal point; and,
- the first story will have three storefronts and the second and third stories will be condominiums.

Mr. Ryan Smith, Barclay-Smith Architects, 2409 N. 4th Street, Flagstaff, stated:

- changes have been made since the presentation last month;
- there will be a brick wall and railings on the balconies;
- the roof glazing has been removed; and,
- the atrium roof will be operable to release heat.

After the presentation, Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- changing the flat roof of glass is a good change; and,
- concern with rooftop mechanical units.

Mr. Smith indicated there will not be any rooftop elements. Split systems with remote condensing units in center of the 4' parapet with interior screen walls around the units to keep things away from the edge of the building. All venting is to be consolidated and one or two flues will be placed on the low slope of the roof.

Commissioners further queried and discussed:

- the opaque balcony;
- the increased symmetry being more desirable than the previous plan;
- concerns with the third level corners in the front and the fourth level corners on the back of the building;
- balcony heights;
- problem with size of block being used with the modular scale not being appropriate in HPD;
- the building needs a more formalized base as opposed to a residential base;
- HOA and CC&Rs;
- glass curtain wall not wearing well over the course of time;
- the 12 condominium owners will benefit from the design, but the Courthouse Plaza will not benefit from the building;
- issues being worked out with the adjacent Norris Building [Mr. Smith: have been in discussion but no one knows at this time the state of the foundation];
- rooftop patios and barbeques; and,
- type of glass used on the atrium [Mr. Smith: non-reflective, low-E].

Mr. Dennis Bueschel, Fire Department, indicated that Code does not permit any type of open flame cooking devices on open balconies or roofs.

Mr. Stroh, **MOTION: to approve HP07-014**, 202 South Montezuma Street, subject to agency comments and the following condition: 1) add a corner element approximately 2' wide up to the height of the brick wall next to it. Ms. Carlson, 2nd. **Vote: 4-2**. (Excused due to an appointment: Rantz). (Opposed: DeGrazia and Wright).

- F. Announcement** regarding Statewide Historic Preservation Conference, June 13-16, 2007 in Prescott.

Ms. Burgess indicated that the conference will be held in various venues throughout the City and an approximate 500+ persons will attend.

- G. Consider approval** of the minutes of 2-09-07.

Ms. Carlson, **MOTION: to approve the minutes** of the February 9, 2007 meeting. Mr. Stroh, 2nd. **Vote: 5-0-1** (Abstention: Todd).

- H. Consider approval** of the minutes of 3-09-07.

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve the minutes** of the March 9, 2007 meeting. Mr. Stroh, 2nd. **Vote: 5-0-1** (Abstention: Todd).

IV. SUMMARY OF CURRENT OR RECENT EVENTS

None.

V. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 10:27 AM.

Doug Stroh, Chairman