



MINUTES
PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Friday, March 9, 2007 - 8:00 AM
City Council Chambers
201 S. Cortez Street, Prescott, AZ

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ATTENDANCE

MEMBERS PRESENT

Doug Stroh, Chairman
Frank DeGrazia, Vice-Chairman
Russ Buchanan
Lorri Carlson
Don Rantz
Marv Wright

OTHERS PRESENT

George Worley, Asst. Community Development
Director
Jane Bristol, Economic Development Director
Gwen Rowitsch, Private Development Facilitator
Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation Specialist
Mike Bacon, Community Planner
Kathy Dudek, Recording Secretary

III. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

- A. HP07-012, 146 South Montezuma Street, Courthouse Plaza Historic Preservation District #1. APN: #109-02-017. Zoning is Downtown Business District (DTB). Request for approval of a permit for an awning and sign for "Prescott Food Store". HPD #1, Courthouse Plaza. Applicant is A Shade Beyond. Community Planner, Mike Bacon.**

Mr. Bacon reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the proposed awning is forest (dark) green and is 17' long and 6' wide;
- the awning extends out from the building;
- Helvetica™ type will be used; and,
- the awning will be placed 8' above the right of way.

Commissioners commented on and queried:

- will the sign cover up the "log siding" [yes].

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve HP07-012, 146 S. Montezuma Street.** Mr. Rantz, 2nd. **Vote: 6-0.**

- B. HP07-013, 347 South Mt. Vernon Street, Joslin & Whipple National Register Historic District, Southeast Prescott Historic Preservation Overlay District. APN: #110-03-043. Zoning is Single Family 9, (SF-9). Request for approval of a building permit for a kitchen remodel and addition to the rear of the house including a deck; request for demolition permit for garage; request**

The City of Prescott endeavors to make all public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. With 48 hours advance notice, special assistance can also be provided for sight and/or hearing impaired persons at public meetings. Please call 777-1100 (voice) or (TDD) to request an accommodation to participate in this meeting.

for approval of permit for new construction of “cabana” in rear yard. HPD #13, Southeast Prescott. Applicant is Richard Sherman, Art & Space Architects, Ltd., for owner Pamela Eldean. Community Planner, Mike Bacon.

Mr. Bacon reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the proposal request permission to remodel the existing garage and convert it into a cabana with the new foundation aligned with the old foundation;
- this morning, staff was informed that the applicant has changed plans; and,
- the applicant is present to discuss the proposed changes and answer questions from Commissioners.

Mr. Richard Sherman, architect, 7534 E. 1st Street, Scottsdale, indicated:

- the cabana will not be constructed, and the patio will be extended into the property/yard area;
- a transition will be maintained between the steps to the driveway and into the yard area; and,
- the same brick will be used for the patio as is being used for the walkways.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- the “cabana” phase is being eliminated [Mr. Sherman: yes]; and,
- the existing garage being demolished in order to install a more substantial retaining wall.

Chairman Stroh indicated he is not comfortable that a motion can be made. Mr. Bacon indicated conditions of approval could be made, including a condition to remove the cabana and replace it with a patio that meets all requirements of the *Land Development Code*.

Ms. Carlson, **MOTION: to approve HP07-013**, 347 S. Mt. Vernon Street, with the following conditions of approval: 1) that the proposal substantially complies with Exhibit A, Pages A-1 through A-8; 2) single or double-hung windows be provided instead of the proposed sliding windows (which conflict with the traditional usage of the single- and double-hung windows of the bungalow style); 3) if applicant wishes to remove cabana and replace it with a patio, that the patio meet all conditions of the *Land Development Code*; and, 4) that a demolition permit be issued for the existing storage shed/garage. Mr. Wright, 2nd.

Vote: 6-0.

- C. HP07-015, 328 Cochise Street, Pine Crest National Register Historic District and Historic Preservation Overlay District. APN: #108-01-053. Zoning is Multi-family Medium (MF-M). Request for approval of a building permit to rebuild garage which was destroyed by wind. HPD #10, Pine Crest. Applicant is owner Bonnie Mitchell. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.**

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the existing garage dates back to the 1920s or 1930s;
- the owner started work on the garage some years ago, and a windstorm in

- February 2007 dismantled the structure;
- the detached garage is a grandfathered building that does not meet side yard setbacks;
 - due to the emergency of the situation in regards to safety, both Mr. George Worley, Assistant Community Development Director and Mr. Mike Baker, Chief Building Official, have approved the rebuilding of the garage on the original footprint based on the fact the garage was destroyed by an “Act of God”;
 - the rebuilding of the garage will have to meet *Land Development Code* requirements but not current setback requirements;
 - the garage is not visible from the street; and,
 - the property is not listed in the National Register.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to approve HP07-015**, 328 Cochise Street, to rebuild existing garage using as much original material as possible with the condition that staff review the design and the construction plans meet all *Land Development Code* requirements with the exception of the setbacks which are grandfathered. Mr. DeGrazia, 2nd. **Vote: 6-0.**

- D. HP07-014, 202 South Montezuma Street, former gas station site/vacant land; Courthouse Plaza Historic Preservation District #1. APN: #109-02-046A. Zoning is Downtown Business District (DTB). Request for approval of a permit for new construction of infill, four-story mixed use building. Applicant is Ryan Smith, Barclay Smith Architects. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.**

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the proposed project has been revised through meeting with City staff, the architect, and the developer, and the applicant is here to provide a PowerPoint™ presentation of the proposed building.

Mr. Ryan Smith, architect, 2409 N. 4th Street, #201, Flagstaff, indicated that changes have been made to the proposed structure and began the presentation on the design elements of the project as well as existing conditions which included the following:

- the building will have a zero setback;
- a very small setback will occur with the building adjacent to the south that is listed in the National Register and is presently on the market;
- no harm will be done to Ms. Norris’ building; and,
- the existing building on the lot will be demolished.

Ms. Burgess cited the Historic Preservation Overlay District #1 Guidelines and the Historic Preservation Master Plan. (Refer to guidelines included in packets). The differences between the proposed project and the guidelines include, but are not limited to:

- the 3-story building height and the lack of the guidelines addressing a 4-story building;
- the present proposal exceeding the maximum building height allowed;
- the 4-foot parapet roof; and,
- the proposed window styles.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- possible underground tanks being removed from the location;
- requirements for the preservation of artifacts; and,
- availability of water allocation for the condo units.

Mr. Ryan Smith, 2409 N. 4th Street, Flagstaff, indicated that the project will:

- include a parking garage that will be accessed from the west end;
- there will be two bedrooms in each of the 12 condominiums;
- there is a possibility of leasing the required parking spaces at the City parking garage;
- three retail spaces will each total approximately 1200 square feet;
- the entrance to the condos will occur at grade; and,
- the staircase in the atrium leads to all four floors and will be vaulted.

Mr. Smith, architect, further discussed the architectural elements of the project:

- the design element combines a contemporary style with the existing historic architecture;
- the cornice will be placed 22-feet above the finished floor grade;
- “jumbo” brick will be used along with two colors of metal (samples of Sierra Tan and Sandstone were presented to the Commission);
- the frameless glass structure [atrium] will become a showpiece; and,
- the atrium roof will be composed of laminated glass.

Chairman Stroh indicated that the project is off to a good start and tends to work with the existing structures.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- the need to see this building combined with the other proposed building [adjacent to the Chamber of Commerce] on E. Goodwin Street;
- concern with the scale of the brick sample provided;
- the feel of a lack of unification to the different floors;
- ADA access; and,
- the possibility of the atrium overheating and possible glare bouncing off the glass.

Mr. Smith, architect, commented on:

- the cornice element is being included to capture the historic vernacular;
- two types of styles have been blended;
- the condo units will be handicap accessible;
- a wheelchair lift will be provided;
- the glass façade faces north;
- operative panels to release the heat will be placed over the atrium; and,
- the brick module unit is being used extensively in historic districts and is also being used in the Summit Building project.

Commissioners further commented on:

- design guidelines for the 2nd and 3rd story windows, which ignore the fact that 2-feet to 4-feet windows on the upper floors must be set at a maximum of 10 feet apart;
- the proposed building adjacent to the Chamber of Commerce is more

- formal and there is a need for the buildings to be more compatible;
- the need for the 4-foot parapet to be “solid” and not just “open” railing;
- the 54-foot height exceeds the guidelines; and,
- guidelines call for a “flat” roof where an “angled” roof is shown (atrium only).

Mr. Bill Otwell, architect, 121 E. Goodwin, indicated that the “angled” glass roof is not shown on the elevation. A rendering should be shown so that possible sun glancing off can be examined.

Ms. Pat Norris, 1836 E. Turquoise Avenue, Phoenix, representing her mother’s estate that includes ownership of the adjacent existing building stated her concerns:

- the age of her building and the status of the building’s existing footing;
- possible water retention between her building and the proposed building that could result in further deterioration to her building; and,
- the difficulty of making future repairs to her building because of the extremely limited setback space that is proposed between buildings.

Mr. Brad Christianson, 3260 Blackjack Ridge Road, indicated he is with the team that is developing the project. He indicated:

- originally the project was planned with four stories on Montezuma and there was a concern with the scale;
- there was a proposed compromise to for the additional height in the rear and decreased height in the front; and,
- the increased height at the rear to include 12 condominiums is important for the project’s financial feasibility.

Further comments from Commissioners included:

- the railings at the top parapet be more solid;
- occupants could look down by walking to the edge of the roof and this aspect would facilitate more privacy;
- remove glass railings and use wrought iron to tie into the building;
- the atrium appears to be in the same plane of the building and not angled on the elevations;
- the possibility of setting the atrium in approximately 4 feet per design guidelines;
- concern with the northeastcorner of the building;
- the elevator towers increasing the overall height of the building;
- changing the smaller windows shown on the elevation to give more balance and symmetry to the buildings;
- the height of the west side of the building with the 4-foot parapet, and the resultant arch will increase the height to 54-feet and a variance will be required; and,
- the clarification of the definition of the term “bedroom”.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to defer** this item to the April 13, 2007 meeting at 8:00 AM. Chairman Stroh, 2nd. **Vote: 6-0.**

(Recess was taken from 9:48 to 9:55 AM)

E. Adoption of Goals for 2007. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to approve** the Goals for 2007 as presented. Chairman Stroh, 2nd. **Vote: 6-0.**

F. Consider approval of the minutes of 2-09-07.

The minutes for February 9, 2007 were not voted on because the Commissioners did not receive the minutes in their packets.

IV. SUMMARY OF CURRENT OR RECENT EVENTS

V. ADJOURNMENT

Doug Stroh, Chairman