



**MINUTES**  
**PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION**  
**Friday, December 8, 2006 - 8:00 AM**  
**City Council Chambers**  
**201 S. Cortez Street, Prescott, AZ**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Rantz called the meeting to order at 8 AM.

**II. ATTENDANCE**

<b>MEMBERS PRESENT:</b> Don Rantz, Chairman Lori Carlson, Vice-Chairman Russ Buchanan Frank DeGrazia Tim Greseth Marv Wright	<b>OTHERS PRESENT:</b> George Worley, Asst. Community Development Director Gary Kidd, City Attorney Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation Specialist Mike Bacon, Community Planner Kathy Dudek, Recording Secretary
<b>MEMBERS ABSENT:</b> Doug Stroh	

**III. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

- A. HP06-031, 119 West Goodwin Street, Territorial Architecture of Prescott MRA Historic District. APN: 109-02-072. Zoning is Downtown Business (DTB). Revised (2<sup>nd</sup>) request for approval of permit for construction of new three-story mixed use building on vacant lot. HPD #1, Courthouse Plaza. Applicant is Otwell Associates for property owner PF Investments, LLC. Preservation Specialist is Nancy Burgess.**

Mr. DeGrazia was recused because of a potential conflict of interest.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report noting the suggested changes that have been made by the architect after last month's meeting. Ms. Burgess indicated:

- the emergency stairs have been relocated;
- the elevations have been changed;
- the balconies have been "opened";
- the proposed brick is a darker color; and,
- the northwest corner has been opened to make it "pedestrian friendly".

Mr. Bill Otwell, architect, 121 E. Goodwin Street, circulated samples of the proposed brick and granite to be used on the project. Mr. Otwell continued with a PowerPoint™ presentation of the changes that were made after last month's meeting.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- the great building design and the compatibility with the downtown area;
- the balconies needing to be clearly defined in the CC&Rs to eliminate clutter and an unsightly appearance;
- parking requirements;
- final height of building [Mr. Otwell: 48-feet with the internal stairwell height at 50-feet];
- the rearview elevation;
- CC&Rs controlling the owners from painting the outside balconies; and,
- the mortar joints.

City Attorney Kidd indicated that the City has no control over the written CC&Rs, nor can the City enforce the CC&Rs. However, the City does look for any open space provisions when the CC&Rs are submitted.

Mr. Otwell indicated that the mortar joints will not be raked due to ice build up; however, the joints will be "tooled" between ¼" and 3/8".

Ms. Carlson, **MOTION: To approve HP06-031**, 3-story commercial building at 119 West Goodwin Street, with the following conditions of approval: 1) the building comply with Agency comments listed in the Staff Memo dated November 28, 2006; 2) that Staff approve the interior balcony materials to be used; and, 3) that Staff approve the east fenestration plans. Mr. Greseth, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 5-0-1** (abstention, recused: DeGrazia).

**B. HP06-034, 232 North Granite Street, Sam'l Hill Warehouse. APN: 113-14-057. Zoning is Industrial Light (IL). Request for approval of remodeling of warehouse for use as art gallery and classrooms for Prescott College. HPD #4, Sam'l Hill Warehouse. Applicant is Otwell Associates for owner Prescott College. Preservation Specialist is Nancy Burgess.**

Mr. DeGrazia was recused because of a potential conflict of interest.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the proposal is to rehabilitate and remodel the structure;
- the west side is considered as the front of the building;
- the north side of the building will include two new exits on the second level.

Mr. Bill Otwell, architect, 121 E. Goodwin Street, gave a brief history of the historic property and indicated:

- the property was renovated sometime between the late 70s and early 80s;
- the restaurant was rehabilitated for the El Escondido Restaurant and was later abandoned;
- Prescott College bought the property and has been using the warehouse for its

- arts program;
- the roof will be matched;
- the current vestibule will be removed and replaced with a more-contemporary opening with air-lock doors;
- the vestibule will be constructed with a 45-degree angle;
- the second floor new openings will have a compatible railing with a steel or concrete header; and,
- the bricks that are removed will be preserved and stored in the building so that the proposed new openings will be reversible if necessary.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- the building's National Register status;
- the roof structure;
- the west elevation;
- the possibility of the kiln becoming an eyesore;
- storage of historic archives;
- existing volunteer elm trees and removal/retention [Mr. Otwell: at least one will have to be removed];
- retaining the sign on the east side of the building;
- the chain link fencing [Mr. Otwell: it belongs to APS]; and,
- landscaping plans.

Mr. Joel Hiller, 16 Pinnacle Drive, representative of Prescott College, indicated:

- he will make note of the kiln's becoming a problem and talk to the art instructors; and,
- the archives previously stored in this building have been moved to the college's new conference center.

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve HP06-034**, 232 N. Granite Street, renovation of Sam'l Hill Warehouse with the following condition of approval: 1) Comply with Agency comments listed within the Staff Memo dated November 28, 2006. Ms. Carlson, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 5-0-1** (abstention, recused: DeGrazia).

A recess was taken from 9:15 AM until 9:25 AM.

- C. HP06-033, 319 South Mt. Vernon Street, Joslin and Whipple Historic District. APN: 110-03-034. Zoning is Single Family 9 (SF-9). Request for support for a variance for a 5' 6" side yard setback where 15 feet are required. HPD #13, Southeast Prescott. Applicant is owner Warren Kuhles. Community Planner is Mike Bacon.**

Mr. Bacon reviewed the staff report and indicated this project came before the Commission in August, 2006. The request is for Commission support of a variance request for a porch where a deck exists. The proposed porch will encroach 8-feet into the required corner 15-foot setback.

Mr. Bacon further indicated that while staff supports the request, the Board of Adjustment has certain other criteria that they look for when granting a variance.

Ms. Carlson, **MOTION: to support variance request** for 319 S. Mt. Vernon Street, for an 8-foot porch encroachment into the required 15-foot corner setback. Mr. DeGrazia, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 6-0.**

**D. HP06-035, 348 South Mt. Vernon Street, Joslin and Whipple Historic District. APN: 110-03-023. Zoning is Single Family 9 (SF-9). Request for approval of remodeling to include raising roofline 6' for master suite. HPD #13, Southeast Prescott. Applicant is owner Karen E. Boomer. Preservation Specialist is Nancy Burgess.**

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the age of the property is uncertain;
- the property is not listed in the National Register and is not considered a contributor to the historic district;
- the owner does not wish to proceed with a change in status and is aware that the remodeling will render the property permanently ineligible;
- the proposal calls for adding 6-feet to the roof of the house; and,
- the overall height of the house will increase from 17-feet to 23-feet.

Ms. Karen Boomer, owner, 348 S. Mt. Vernon Avenue, indicated she did not know the type of siding that would be used. Ms. Boomer indicated her contractor was out of town.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- the type of siding should not be T-1-11 as shown on the site plan;
- alternatives to make the project more compatible;
- having a recessed balcony on the east elevation;
- dormers being placed on the north or south side of the house and having windows;
- using materials to create a horizontal line, i.e., 4" or 6" lap siding or square-cut cedar shingles;
- installing a more-compatible front door;
- the lack of necessary architectural elevations; and,
- having the applicant provide the necessary elevations at a future meeting.

When asked, Ms. Boomer indicated she could have the required materials at the January meeting.

Ms. Carlson, **MOTION: to postpone HP06-035**, 348 S. Mt. Vernon Avenue, to the January 12, 2007 meeting at 8:00 AM. Mr. Wright, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 6-0.**

**E. HP06-036, 939 Yavapai Drive, Pine Crest Historic District. APN: 108-01-057B. Zoning is Multi-family Medium (MF-M). Request for approval of fence permit and permit for remodel to include replacement of windows and front door (door opening to be enlarged to 36"). HPD #10, Pine Crest. Applicant is property owner Julia King. Community Planner is Mike Bacon.**

Mr. Bacon reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- this is a classical bungalow in the Pine Crest Historic District;
- interior improvements were made after Commission approval in November, 2005;
- the request contains the following three parts:
  - 1) Replacing all existing windows with energy-efficient, double-hung, 6/6 windows;
  - 2) Replacing the front door using a 36"-wide Craftsman style without sidelights; and,
  - 3) Installing a solid fence, or open-style 3" slats, in the rear yard.

Ms. Julie King, owner, 939 Yavapai Drive, indicated that there will be no sidelights in the new front door. Also, the existing windows would be replicated; however, the bedroom window to the rear of the property may need to be enlarged to meet Code.

Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- the front windows having mullions on the top and a single pane on the bottom; and,
- using a trellis on the east side for more compatibility.

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve HP06-036**, 939 Yavapai Drive, with the following conditions of approval: 1) Replace nearly all the existing windows with energy-efficient, Low E-type, entirely wooden, double-hung, 12-pane windows at locations noted on the plans contained in the Staff Memo dated November 28, 2006. These windows will match the existing historical windows, and replace sliding windows in the bedroom with the front windows to be 6-mullion over solid glass (6/1); 2) Add a new 6' high cedar fence proposed within the rear yard, with trellis material on the east side; 3) Replace the front door with a Craftsman style door and enlarge it to 36" wide; and, 4) the bedroom window replacement be reviewed and approved by Staff. Mr. Greseth, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 5-0.** (Ms. Carlson was excused from the meeting prior to the vote).

**F. HP06-037, 1089 Old Hassayampa Lane, Historic Homes at Hassayampa Historic District. APN: 109-07-161. Zoning is Specially Planned Community (SPC). Request for approval of permit to install a new window in the existing garage. HPD #15, Historic Homes at Hassayampa. Applicant is owner Charles E. Kennedy. Preservation Specialist is Nancy Burgess.**

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the free-standing garage is not listed in the National Register;
- the window will be installed on the south garage elevation;
- the window will be screened by an existing tree;
- the window will have a 2 x 6 header; and,
- the new window will not affect the historic home.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- future electrical wiring to the garage; and,
- the type of window material that will be used.

Mr. Charles Kennedy, owner, 1089 Old Hassayampa Lane, indicated that future electrical work to the garage will be underground. He also stated that the window will be aluminum-clad.

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve HP06-037**, 1089 Old Hassayampa Lane, with the following conditions of approval: 1) Comply with Agency comments listed in the Staff Memo dated November 28, 2006; and, 2) the future electrical work must be underground and meet City codes. Mr. DeGrazia, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 5-0.**

**G. Consider approval of the minutes of 11-17-06.**

Mr. DeGrazia asked that the vote for Item D, HP06-031 reflect that he recused himself from voting. The minutes will be corrected.

Mr. DeGrazia, **MOTION: to approve the minutes as corrected** for November 17, 2006. Mr. Wright, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 5-0.**

**IV. SUMMARY OF CURRENT OR RECENT EVENTS**

Ms. Burgess noted that the original "Elk" has been installed on top of the Elks Opera House and will be unveiled and lighted at tonight's Acker Music Festival.

**V. ADJOURNMENT**

Chairman Rantz adjourned the meeting at 10:05 AM.

---

Don Rantz, Chairman