



**MINUTES**  
**PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION**  
**Friday, November 17, 2006 - 8:00 AM**  
**City Council Chambers**  
**201 S. Cortez Street, Prescott, AZ**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Rantz called the meeting to order at 8 AM.

**II. ATTENDANCE**

<b>MEMBERS PRESENT:</b> Don Rantz, Chairman Lori Carlson, Vice-Chairman Russ Buchanan Frank DeGrazia Doug Stroh Marv Wright	<b>OTHERS PRESENT:</b> George Worley, Asst. Community Development Director Gary Kidd, City Attorney Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation Specialist Mike Bacon, Community Planner Kathy Dudek, Recording Secretary
<b>MEMBERS ABSENT:</b> Tim Greseth	

**III. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

- A. HP06-030, 127 South Mt. Vernon Street, East Prescott Historic District, the Hedrick D. Aitken House. APN: 110-01-052. Zoning is Single Family 9 (SF-9). Request for approval of permit to remodel existing garage into guest house and permit for construction of new garage. HPD #13, Southeast Prescott. Applicants are owners Chick and Christy Hastings. Preservation Specialist is Nancy Burgess.**

Ms. Burgess and Mr. Bacon reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the proposed project is for the Aitken House which was listed in the National Register in 1978;
- the owners propose to convert the existing garage (not listed in the National Register) into a guest house and construct a new garage;
- the conversion requires a conditional use permit;
- the project meets the requirements of the *Land Development Code*; and,
- the staff is recommending approval of the project with vertical windows rather than horizontal as proposed to unify the overall space.

Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- the compass direction should appear on the elevations;
- the area behind the existing garage in relation to parking;
- the project needs more detail and continuity; and,
- the front of the new garage has one façade that doesn't match anything else.

Mr. Charles Hastings, owner, 127 S. Mt. Vernon Avenue, indicated he is open to suggestions as long as the appearance of the property is maintained. He further explained that both buildings will be stuccoed except for the gable ends.

Mr. Jeremy Jones, 930 Manzanita Avenue, explained the rationale of the materials, the gable ends and the open breezeway.

Mr. Stroh, **MOTION: to approve HP06-030**, 127 S. Mt. Vernon Avenue subject to the following two conditions: 1) provide horizontal siding on all four gable ends and eliminate fish-scale shingles as presented in addition to stucco; and, 2) replace the large windows with pairs of windows with a more vertical feel. Mr. DeGrazia, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 6-0.**

**B. HP06-032, 939 Yavapai Drive, Pine Crest Historic District. APN: 108-01-057B. Zoning is Multi-family Medium (MF-M). Request for approval of interior remodel including electrical, plumbing and mechanical. HPD #10, Pine Crest. Applicant is Foreste Holmes, LLC for property owners Julia and Bill King. Preservation Specialist is Nancy Burgess.**

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the home is listed in the National Register;
- the project consists mainly of a remodel to the interior electrical, mechanical, and plumbing;
- the remodel does not affect the exterior of the home;
- further work is being planned and will come before Commission at a later date;
- there are no known issues with the load-bearing walls; and,
- a new opening for a 48" x 48" window in the bathroom will affect the exterior but will not be seen as it is located at the rear of the property.

Ms. Carlson, **MOTION: to approve HP06-032**, 939 Yavapai Drive, subject to agency comments listed in the Staff Report dated November 6, 2006. Mr. Buchanan, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 6-0.**

**C. Discussion regarding Secretary of the Interior's Standards and design guidelines for Courthouse Plaza Historic District. Preservation Specialist is Nancy Burgess.**

Ms. Burgess reviewed the following:

- the Secretary of the Interior's Standards;
- the City Code which was adopted in 1990 as the 3<sup>rd</sup> revision;
- obtaining permits and the Certificate of Appropriateness; and,
- the Historic Preservation Master Plan and design guidelines.

- D. HP06-031, 119 West Goodwin Street, Territorial Architecture of Prescott MRA Historic District. APN: 109-02-072. Zoning is Downtown Business (DTB). Request for approval of construction of new three-story mixed use building on vacant lot. HPD #1, Courthouse Plaza. Applicant is Otwell Associates for property owner PF Investments, LLC. Preservation Specialist is Nancy Burgess. Community Planner is Mike Bacon.**

Mr. DeGrazia recused himself from this item due to a conflict of interest.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the proposal is for a new three-story building at the corner of Goodwin and Montezuma Streets;
- the building calls out 37,179 square feet;
- the first floor will be for retail businesses;
- both the second and third floors are planned for condominiums;
- there will be two storefronts on Goodwin Street and two storefronts on Montezuma Street;
- the cornice trim is proposed to be constructed of fiberglass;
- the building will be constructed of concrete with a brick veneer; and,
- the height limitation is 48' and the top of the parapet is 46'8".

Mr. Bill Otwell, architect, 121 E. Goodwin Street indicated:

- the building is proposed by the Pierce Family;
- the family wishes to construct a high quality building that fits in with the historic character of the neighborhood;
- the first floor will be tourist-oriented retail;
- the upper floors are being planned as condominiums with each level containing four units;
- it is possible that the second floor may be used for offices; and,
- the project meets the zero setback requirements.

Mr. Otwell gave a presentation describing the proposed project in Prescott. The presentation also included highlights of construction in the downtown areas of Flagstaff, Arizona, and Bozeman, Montana. A sample of the proposed brick veneer was presented to Commission.

Commissioners queried and commented on:

- the good job in meeting the downtown design guidelines;
- the building's similarity to McCormick Place and the Summit Building;
- the project's replicating every piece and part of downtown Prescott;
- the need to vary the building façade so it is not another replication;
- approaching the project with a more open corner;
- balcony placement;
- the building does not fit the prior uses of the lot, i.e., a former stable and gas station;
- the building appearing to be horizontal rather than vertical;
- opening up the first floor to make it more pedestrian friendly;
- making the balconies on the front façade more symmetrical;
- the balconies and future "plastic furniture" etc., that could be placed there;
- the preference of a darker shade of brick.

Mr. Otwell indicated that the balconies would be easy to change; however, the corner entry creates an awkward interior circulation pattern. Mr. Otwell also indicated that there is a possibility of using granite on the first level.

Commissioners further queried and commented on:

- consider moving the open balconies to the east and west sides of the building;
- the newly-presented western elevation;
- the railings of the balcony could be more ornate and opaque to masque the potential balcony furniture;
- the parapet height and stairwell height;
- CC&Rs to avoid an unsightly balcony;
- rooftop mechanical elements that would be visible from a distance;
- parking spaces and stall widths; and,
- the projected longevity of the fiberglass cornice.

Mr. Otwell indicated that there would be mechanical on the rooftop; however, a rooftop yard/garden is a possibility. The fiberglass would require painting and maintenance to avoid its drying out.

**Ms. Carlson, MOTION:** to defer a decision and postpone this item until the architect has a chance to review and revise the project with the following recommendations: 1) a colonnade-type design be used on the corner; 2) more vertical type windows; 3) balconies placed more symmetrically; 4) change in stairwell placement on the east elevation; 5) vary materials to enhance verticality; and, 6) consider a darker shade of brick for the building. Mr. Stroh, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 5-0-1** (abstention, recused: DeGrazia). [a date certain was not set].

**E. Consider approval of the minutes of 10-13-06.**

Chairman Rantz, **MOTION:** to approve the minutes of the October 13, 2006 meeting. Mr. Wright, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 6-0.**

#### **IV. SUMMARY OF CURRENT OR RECENT EVENTS**

Ms. Burgess reported that the "original elk" will be moved from Prescott Valley to the Elks Theater and should be ready for Acker Night on December 8, 2006.

#### **V. ADJOURNMENT**

Chairman Rantz adjourned the meeting at 8:15 AM.

---

Don Rantz, Chairman